2 Global, regional and local perspectives towards sustainable urban and rural development

Jonas Rabinovich

I shall then briefly analyze the experience of the city of Curitiba, in Brazil, as a basic reference; the incipient transfer of Curitiba’s experience to the whole State of Parana will also be briefly described, with emphasis on rural-urban linkages, followed by a discussion of some issues related to the replicability of successful urban management experiences. Put briefly, the paper attempts to highlight some relevant linkages that, following the conclusions of the 1996 Habitat II Conference, in Istanbul, can reinforce and complement lessons from local, regional and international perspectives.

Local-global linkages: towards a cooperation framework

The international development community is gradually acknowledging the inter-connections between global and local events and initiatives. At the 1992 “Earth Summit” (the United Nations Conference on Environment and Development-UNCED) in Rio de Janeiro, Agenda 21 called for support from local actors, both local and central government and Non-Governmental Organizations - NGOs. Following UNCED, there has been a shift in the perception of human, social and urban development. In Copenhagen, at the Social Summit, support for civil society was stressed in order to address the complex issues of social integration, poverty eradication and employment. At the Women’s Summit in Beijing, the role of NGOs in promoting gender equity was emphasized. Also in Istanbul, at the “City Summit”, was the role of local actors seen as central to building sustainable human settlements.

Overall, humankind no longer seems to accept development at the expense of the poor. In keeping with this vision, UNDP has adopted the concept of “Sustainable Human Development” (SHD) as the basic framework for all its development cooperation. SHD is a form of development that not only generates growth, but distributes its results equitably; it regenerates the environment rather than destroying it, and empowers people rather than marginalizing them. It is development that is pro-nature, pro-poor, pro-women and pro-people.

Apart from demographic aspects, there are many reasons why human settlements are key factors in helping to promote SHD:

1 Cities and towns are seriously affected by overcrowding, environmental degradation, under-employment, social disruption and inadequate housing infrastructure and services.
2 The origin of many global environmental problems relates to the patterns of production and consumption, waste, air and water pollution is to be found at cities and at the local level. Cities are engines of economic growth, and thus the economic prosperity of nations will also depend on their performance.

Global trends

It can be argued that the international community does recognize the global nature of the above issues, and proposes that a global approach could also greatly enhance progress towards achieving sustainable human settlements. At the same time, the global context presents a series of trends which seem conducive to closer local-global interaction. These are mentioned below for the sole purpose of establishing the broader context, as this paper does not intend to analyze in detail these important trends nor their mutually reinforcing inter-linkages.

Decentralization. Democratic governments and market-based economic systems have gradually replaced authoritarian regimes in many countries during the past ten years. Out of 75 developing and transitional countries with populations greater than five million, all but 12 claim to have embarked on some form of transfer of political power to local units of government.

The end of a bipolarized world. The end of the Soviet Union, the creation of the Commonwealth of Independent States and its consequences are redesigning international relations, financial investment patterns, official development assistance and many other worldwide interchanges. Cities and metropolitan areas emerge as independent units competing for resources and investments, both in developed and developing countries. A group of powerful inter-linked internationalized cities has taken full advantage of the opportunities of the new economic and technological environments. National governments acknowledge the economic and social importance of metropolitan regions, which also emerge as new key players in the international scenario.

Globalization. Globalization is another trend that plays an important contextual role in shaping new local-global relations. As a preparatory activity for the Habitat II Conference, UNDP organized the round-table “The Next Millennium: Cities for People in a Globalizing World”, which brought together more than 1,500 development thinkers and experts, who then produced more than 80 papers outlining the challenges and opportunities for human development in urban areas in a globalizing world. Among the various recommendations, the following should be highlighted: existing patterns of urban production and consumption should be made more sustainable; the human development of cities should be improved; social and political governance at the local level should be strengthened; and resources for urban development should be mobilized.

Competition and cooperation between cities. If, on the one hand, decentralization and globalization trends seem to place cities and metropolitan areas in new competitive arenas for resources and investments, on the other hand the level of technical cooperation among cities is reaching unprecedented levels. The strengthening of cities’ associations and NGOs working directly with local authorities and communities enormously facilitates the process of interchanging information and experience. The problems faced by cities worldwide are alike to some extent, and both policy-makers and urban managers can improve their capacity through mutual learning.

Since the Pre-UNCED World Urban Forum, held in Curitiba, Brazil, major global cities’ associations have understood the importance of speaking with a unified voice. The International Union of Local Authorities, United Towns, Metropolis, The Summit of the World’s Major Cities and a series of other international, regional and national cities’ associations have joined forces in the creation of the “Group of Four Plus”, a coordinating mechanism which also facilitates contacts between local and international actors. This mechanism was very useful during the preparation of Habitat II and is presently being revised by the cities’ associations.

Importance of vertical and horizontal relations. Local authorities worldwide have been persistently arguing for stronger vertical linkages between municipal and national powers. However, many municipalities tend to overlook the importance of horizontal relations at the local level; for example, the dialogue between city hall, local councils, NGOs, Community-Based Organizations (CBOs) and other such civil society organizations. At UNDP, this process is referred to as “local-local dialogue”, which is supported by programs such as the Local Initiative Facility for the Urban Environment (LIFE), presently operational in 14 countries. More details about LIFE will be presented later.

New economic blocks. There seems to be a growing tendency for countries to consider, at the same time, the advantages of international
economic liberalization - a move towards more open commerce through less tax barriers - and the advantages of protectionism - a move towards the protection of national industries and domestic economies. Both approaches seem to exist simultaneously in the policy agenda of most countries, depending on the issue at stake and depending on their individual import-export profile. The formation of the European Union, NAFTA, MERCOSUL in South America and other economic blocks is a concrete demonstration of this fact. In South America, for example, MERCOSUL has certainly increased economic relations, but it has also begun to internationalize urban poverty characteristics. Brazilians are proud to produce 70 per cent of the soya bean crops in Paraguay, despite the fact that several poor families had to cross the border in search of work, ending up homeless and jobless in peri-urban areas after the harvest.

This paper does not intend to analyze these complex relations, but merely to draw attention to the fact that local governments can no longer afford to ignore what happens internationally, no matter how distant these issues may seem to be for the routine of a local administration. Global trends will influence both the patterns of employment and the availability and location of investments at the local level. National welfare-state policies seem threatened, placing an increasing burden on the social agendas of local government.

**Technological communications/information revolution** The growing flow of information and improved communication facilities affect cities in at least two unprecedented ways. On the one hand, it affects them externally due to factors such as: improved communications with other cities and other levels of government; access to potentially useful technical information and technologies; possibility of stronger linkages between universities, city administrations, private sector and other institutions, among other potential advantages. On the other hand, it also affects cities internally, especially in so far as the following factors are concerned: potential to improve land registry databases and information about the city; improved communications among internal departments; improved public relations; possibility to increase municipal revenues through more detailed monitoring of property taxes, among other potential advantages.

Nowadays, in principle, a student can have as much information as the office of the mayor, which factor can contribute to more democratic urban governance practices. However, it is also important not to mystify technology: software can complement, but it does not substitute human capacity development. All the elements above seem to point to a changing context in which "urban/rural", "global/local", "city/countryside", are not necessarily competing and mutually exclusive aspects, but increasingly complementary in forming a path towards sustainability.

**A growing challenge: are cities sustainable?**

**Environmental consequences of urbanization in developing countries**

Urbanization in developing countries has been accompanied by an alarming growth in the incidence of poverty and environmental degradation. Today, one out of four urban dwellers lives in absolute poverty; another one in four is classified as relatively poor. By the end of this decade, according to the UN, poor urban households are projected to increase by 76 per cent. This rapid concentration of hundreds of millions of people has placed an extraordinary strain on the ability of governments - both municipal and national - to meet the needs of city dwellers. Urban environmental problems - such as water and sanitation, waste management, public transport and energy - are particularly acute, and growing worse, as available services and resources are overwhelmed by expanding populations.

Many city dwellers in developing countries live in crushing poverty: by the year 2000, more than half the developing countries' poor will be living in cities and towns: 90 per cent in Latin America, 45 per cent in Asia and 40 per cent in Africa. Their living conditions are alarming, as their numbers far outstrip the supplies of water, waste removal, transport and health assistance.

**Urbanization trends are inevitable**

The growth of cities is inevitable - and irreversible. Standing at 2.4 billion in 1990, the world's urban population will rise to 3.2 billion in the year 2000 and 5.5 billion in 2025. The developing countries' share in these totals - 63 per cent in 1990 - will rise to 71 per cent in 2000, and 80 per cent in 2025. By the end of the 1990s, Mexico City will have almost 25 million people, São Paulo almost 22 million. Calcutta, Shanghai and Bombay will each have more than 15 million residents, and 13 other cities in developing countries will have more than 10 million, namely: Seoul, Cairo, Dacca, Delhi, Lagos, Beijing, Bangkok, Manila, Jakarta, Karachi, Tianjin, Buenos Aires and Rio de Janeiro.

In addition to the growth of these large scale cities, the growth of small and medium-sized cities will also continue at unprecedented rates.
At the same time, the growth of peri-urban areas is reaching considerable proportions, although with different regional characteristics. More recent development plans recognize that cities have multiple and complex links with rural areas and enhance the importance of urban-rural linkages.

Issues of priority concern

In August 1994, the International Colloquium of Mayors on Social Development was held at the United Nations Headquarters in New York. The event was sponsored by UNDP in cooperation with the United Nations Center for Human Settlements-UNCHS and the abovementioned Group of Poor Cities' Association. Prior to the Colloquium, a survey undertaken by UNDP with mayors worldwide provided a representative sample of the main problems presently faced by urban areas: unemployment was listed as the most serious urban-related problem, followed by inadequate housing. The survey clearly demonstrated that, despite national differences, urban problems are very similar worldwide.

Others priority issues mentioned by mayors as “most severe” were, in this order: insufficient solid waste management; violence and personal insecurity; urban poverty; inadequate sanitation/sewerage; air pollution; lack of public transport; inadequate water supply; inadequate social services (health, education); insufficient participation; and discrimination (ethnic, women, poor). A sample of 135 mayors geographically distributed throughout North America/Western Europe, Eastern Europe, Latin America and Caribbean, Africa, Arab States, Asia and Pacific answered the questionnaire.

Are cities sustainable?

Perhaps the most appropriate question is: can cities become more sustainable? Intrinsically, cities are not necessarily sustainable. Most local and global environmental problems are generated in cities or are caused by consumption patterns existing in cities. This simple fact is the key to the understanding that cities do have a very important role to play in the path towards sustainability. For example, urban air pollution is a major problem in cities in developing countries, overwhelmingly derived from energy combustion in transport, industry and households in densely inhabited areas. Half of Bangkok’s population is reported to suffer from respiratory problems due to the poor quality of the air caused by traffic congestion and inappropriate fuel mixes, while a similar trend is faced by millions of inhabitants in Mexico City.

Energy use is also often the source of wastes that degrade land and water courses. In addition, it is directly related to damage to much wider areas (as with acid rain) and to the atmosphere (greenhouse gases, global warming and ozone depletion). The world’s urban wastes (excluding construction debris) are estimated at some 720 billion tons annually, of which 440 billion tons are generated in industrial countries. Only a very small percentage of this amount is dealt with properly, causing drainage problems and breeding ground for infectious diseases, ultimately with serious public health consequences. The Peruvian cholera epidemic that began in Lima and killed 3,600 people in 12 countries in 1991 is a clear example of the dangers of contaminated water supplies, inadequate sewage disposal, irrigation with contaminated water, and poor hygiene in the handling and preparation of food.

At the same time, urban wastes do not only generate local problems. Agenda 21 clearly points out that 70 per cent of maritime pollution is primarily caused by land-based activities, encompassing poor land use management, inadequate sewerage facilities and industrial pollution being brought from inland streams and rivers into international waters.

To think "urban", however, is to think hope - and not despair. Today the growth of cities is increasingly seen as essential for human development. The Gross National Product per capita numbers are much higher in countries with more of their people living in cities. Cities produce 60 per cent of Gross Domestic Product in developing countries. The economics of scale in large cities generates goods and services far in excess of their share of the total population. This higher productivity of urban labor means that wages are higher, while employment opportunities are greater, especially for women. Cities also give their residents the knowledge and skills to become more productive - a beneficial cycle. Cities promote the modernization of agriculture, provide markets for farm goods and reduce pressure on the land.

Moreover, the urban environment permits the efficient mobilization of people’s energies and resources, enhances the income-generating ability of the informal sector and promotes education and skills training. Greater participation in the urban economy leads to the creation of a skilled and literate workforce. Thus, the promise of cities is to liberate the mass of people from poverty, hunger, disease and premature death.

What can make cities more sustainable

A deteriorating urban environment is the enemy of sustainable development. Concern for the urban environment is not simply a concern for the health of urban populations or for the hypothetical rights of
unborn generations: it is a concern for making sustainable development possible and manageable. A few fundamental points can be mentioned:

1 A more efficient management of the city environment is needed. A concern with reduced use of natural resources per unit of output should be enforced (for example, through public transport policies addressing mobility needs and environmentally sound industrial development), as should policies enhancing savings in public services (for example, a demand-oriented approach to water supply management), increased attention to operation and maintenance of public facilities, improved governance and political will towards sustainability principles.

2 Improved land use planning within urban and peripheral urban areas, thus avoiding the occupation of disaster prone areas and the encouragement of balanced high and low density uses.

3 Adoption of policies that are conducive to a more equitable access of city services (water, energy, transport, waste disposal, educational and health facilities) by the urban poor as well as to more participatory decision-making processes.

What UNDP is doing to promote the sustainability of cities

UNDP has adopted an approach to urban problems that links sustainable human development with economic productivity. It encourages the adoption of strategies that promote equitable growth, gender equality and participatory development. The main goal is to enlarge people’s choices by assisting in the development of their capabilities, improving their access to employment, credit, health and education, and increasing their participation in economic, social and political activities. UNDP promotes human development in urban areas by means of providing support for actions in five priority areas, namely: poverty alleviation; strengthening urban local government and administration; improving the urban environment; providing urban infrastructure, shelter and services; and promoting the private sector and NGOs.

As of the first quarter of 1993, UNDP, including the UN Capital Development Fund-UNCDF, was assisting over 280 ongoing urban development and human settlement projects at a total cost of over US$ 470 million. Of this amount, US$ 330 million was provided from UNDP resources and US$ 140 million from government and third party cost sharing contributions. UNDP-assisted programs are executed by specialized agencies of the UN system, and increasingly by developing country governments and NGOs. UNDP’s main partner agency in the urban sector is the United Nations Center for Human Settlements - UNCHS/HABITAT, which is promoting the role of cities in sustainable development, strengthening urban management, and coordinating the implementation of the Global Strategy for Shelter in the Year 2000. UNDP has also worked in close collaboration with the United Nations Children’s Fund-UNICEF, the International Labor Organization-ILO, the World Health Organization-WHO, the United Nations Population Fund-UNFPA, the United Nations Department of Development Support and Management Services-DSMS, Regional Commissions and the World Bank. Urban infrastructure, shelter and services represent 37 per cent of all ongoing projects.

Some examples of ongoing national, regional and global-level cooperation among partner agencies follow.

Urban Management Program (UMP)

UMP is a ten-year-old global technical support program designed to strengthen the contribution that cities in developing countries make toward human development, including economic growth, social development and the reduction of poverty. UNDP provides the core funding and overall monitoring for the UMP; HABITAT is the executing agency, with the World Bank as an advisory agency. In addition, WHO, ILO, other UN Agencies, bilateral donors and NGOs provide various important types of support. UMP’s uniqueness is its capacity to draw on the strengths of the three multilateral partner agencies to create a demand-driven, coordinated approach to technical cooperation in five areas of concentration, namely: municipal finance; land management; urban infrastructure; urban environment; and poverty alleviation.

Local Initiative Facility for Urban Environment (LIFE)

The principal objective of LIFE is to promote “local-local” dialogue - for example, the contact among municipalities, NGOs and CBOs - to improve the quality of the urban environment. Through LIFE, developing countries and multilateral and bilateral donor agencies recognize the crucial role local authorities, NGOs and CBOs play in promoting sustainable urban environment and development. Fourteen countries have been chosen for the pilot phase of the LIFE program. In each selected country a participatory consultation will be held to bring together NGOs, CBOs, local authorities, central government and the private sector, aiming to establish priorities and guidelines for the
selection and funding of small-scale projects by a national selection committee. Proposals for regional and interregional activities are submitted by NGO networks and cities' associations.

Public-Private Partnership for the Urban Environment

The purpose of this program is to create a mechanism which can help promote the involvement of the private sector in programs and projects addressing urban environmental problems in developing countries. UNDP has several ongoing urban programs, two of which already enjoy great donor support, the abovementioned LIFE and UMP. Whereas these programs are mainly oriented toward building capacities of governments, municipalities and NGOs, Public-Private Partnerships focus on enhancing the role of the private sector in three specific areas, namely: water and sanitation; waste management; and energy.

A small number of cities will be selected initially. In each of these cities, models of technology cooperation are being established, and it is hoped that these models will be replicated in other cities. The main goal of the projects is the dissemination and exchange of technology/information and the development of concrete joint-ventures between public and private sector agents to tackle the abovementioned problems. UNDP's Project Development Facility for Public-Private Partnerships was successfully launched during Habitat II, initially with the support from the governments of Switzerland, Netherlands and New Zealand.

Ultimately, a successful project is the one that supports the improvement of living conditions of the urban and rural poor in a sustainable manner. Sustainability implies a sensible balance between economic, environmental and social policy interventions. In this context, the experience of Curitiba, Brazil, deserves to be briefly presented to illustrate how these concerns have been considered by a most positive experience at the local level.

Curitiba, Brazil: a reference for urban environmental management

Curitiba, the capital of the State of Parana in South-eastern Brazil, has faced explosive growth since the 1950s. It has changed from a town of 300,000 in 1950 to a metropolis of 2.2 million in 1990, making it Brazil's fastest growing metropolitan area. Initially, various trends indicated a tendency towards uncontrolled growth and the well known social and environmental negative consequences of rapid urbanization. The city's geophysical configuration suggested a physical growth pattern following that of São Paulo, the biggest mega-city in the region, located 250 miles north of Curitiba. The combination of the city's rapid economic surge from a small center for processing agricultural products to a large regional industrial and commercial pole and the mechanization of plantations attracted massive waves of migrants from the countryside. The poverty and income profile in Curitiba is similar to other cities in South-eastern Brazil.

However, even though all trends pointed in the direction of chaotic urbanization, Curitiba has shown that tendencies do not necessarily have to become an ultimate fate. The city has frequently been recognized by the international media, experts and development institutions as a successful example of urban environmental management. From the early 1970s to date, Curitiba has embarked on a different path, following conscious political decisions backed by popular participation. This section examines how this path was laid out, as well as what was learned along the way. Curitiba has had - and still has - a variety of urban-related problems, like any other city worldwide. How did the city administration make a difference? I will try to answer this question by giving an account of three basic aspects: principles, procedures and lessons.

Principles

Priority to people and public transport The city administration consciously decided to take control of the urban growth process. The authorities emphasized growth should take place along prescribed structural axes, allowing the city to spread out while developing public transport that kept shops, workplaces and homes readily accessible to one another. Curitiba's road network and public transport system are probably the most influential elements accounting for the present shape of the city. Total priority was given to public transport throughout the entire city, and to pedestrians downtown.

The city has been growing in expanding concentric circles from the city center. In the mid-1970s, however, the city authorities began to implement the urban design structure that counteracted the unplanned urban sprawl and emphasized linear growth along five pre-determined structural axes. Land use legislation was enacted to guide this growth, allowing for higher housing densities in streets served by public transport. Over the years, urban growth has been encouraged along the structural axes, also known as structural sectors. Each axis was designed as a "primary road system": the central road has two restricted lanes in the middle for express buses, being flanked by two local roads. There are
high capacity one-way streets into and out of the central city one block on either side of this central road. In the areas adjacent to each axis, land use legislation has encouraged high density occupation, together with services and commerce.

The city increased these spatial changes with a bus-based public transportation system designed for convenience and speed. The five express bus lanes existing along the structural axes were complemented by interdistrict and feeder buses that expanded as the city grew. There are large bus terminals at the end of the five express busways, where people can transfer to interdistrict, feeder or intercity buses. Medium-sized terminals are located every two kilometers along the express routes, and a single fare allows passengers to transfer from the express routes to interdistrict and local buses. In high demand routes, tubular, subway-style boarding stations speed boarding times through pre-payment and level boarding. This system replicates some of the advantages of a subway system at the surface, costing approximately 200 times less than a conventional subway. Articulated and the only bi-articulated buses in the world double and triple the capacity of the express busways.²

Curitiba has over 500,000 private cars (more per capita that any Brazilian city except Brasília). Remarkably, 75 per cent of all commuters - that is, more than 1.3 million passengers per day - take the bus. This has resulted in fuel consumption rates that are 25 per cent lower than those prevailing in comparable Brazilian cities, which factor has contributed to the city having one of the country's lowest rates of ambient air pollution. Finally, the average Curitiba resident spends only about 10 per cent of income on transport, which is a relatively low percentage in Brazil.³

Designing with nature Flooding was one of the most serious problems Curitiba faced. The city center used to have frequent floods that were worsened by the construction of houses and other structures along streams and river basins. In addition, during the 1950s and 1960s, many streams were covered and converted into artificial underground canals that made drainage even more difficult. Necessary drainage works had to be dug underground at a very high cost. At the same time, new developments on the periphery of the city were being undertaken without proper attention to drainage.

Beginning in the late 1960s, some strips of land for drainage have been set aside and certain low-lying areas have been put off-limits for building purposes. In 1975, the remaining natural drainage system was protected by a restrictive legislation. River basins were classified as special areas requiring protection and management, often through park development. Stream protection strips were developed as linear parks and supported by comprehensive tree planting. Other areas prone to flooding were transformed into parks and enhanced with sports and leisure facilities. The parks are also well-integrated in the transportation system via both free green-colored public buses and bicycle paths.

There were several advantages to this "design with nature" strategy. The preventive measures allowed the city to forego substantial new investments in flood control. In 1970, Curitiba averaged only 0.5 m² of serviced green space per capita; this figure has now increased one hundredfold to 50 m² per person, and all that during a period of rapid population growth. The manner by which this was accomplished is a lesson in environmental management: solving several problems with "win-win" solutions.

Appropriate rather than high-tech solutions Curitiba could have chosen a number of technologically sophisticated solutions to its woes. Two examples illustrate this point. The conventional wisdom was that cities with over a million people needed a subway system to deal with congestion. The other prevailing dogma was that cities that generated over one million tons of solid waste annually required expensive mechanical garbage separation plants. Instead, Curitiba chose different paths for its transportation and garbage problems, based on the principles of simplicity and resource conservation.

The choice of transportation technology was the result of simple economics: an underground metro system would have cost US$ 90-100 million per kilometer, while the express busway system came in at US$ 200,000 per kilometer. Bus operation and maintenance were also familiar technologies that could be operated by the private sector.

Concerning trash generation and collection, Curitiba instituted two innovative programs. The "Garbage that is not Garbage" initiative involves curbside collection and disposal of recyclable materials that have been sorted by households. The "Garbage Purchase" program, designed specifically for low-income areas, seeks to clean up sites that are difficult for the conventional waste management system to serve by exchanging garbage bags collected by residents for bus tokens, parcels of surplus food, and children's school notebooks. Another initiative, "All Clean", temporarily hires retired and unemployed people to clean up specific areas of the city where litter has accumulated.

The results of these challenges to conventional wisdom have been very positive. In addition to the benefits of the aforementioned bus system, the city has today a self-financing public transportation system, instead of being saddled by debt to pay for the construction and operating subsidies of a subway system. The savings have been invested in other
priority areas. Concerning solid waste management, over 70 per cent of households participate in the recycling programs. Nearly 1,200 trees are "saved" each day by the volume of recycled paper alone. Sixty neighborhoods with 31,000 families have benefited from the garbage purchase program by receiving nearly a million bus tokens, 1,200 tons of surplus food, and school notebooks in exchange for collecting over 11,000 tons of garbage. These innovations have reduced the costs and increased the effectiveness of the city's solid waste management system while conserving resources, beautifying the city, and providing employment - another "win-win" and low-tech solution.

Innovation and participation The city planners of Curitiba have learned that good systems and incentives are better than just theoretical good plans. The city's Master Plan helped to forge a vision and strategic principles to guide future developments. This vision was transformed into reality by reliance on the right systems and incentives, not on the slavish implementation of a static plan.

An example of a system that yields desirable results is the provision of public information about land. Curitiba's City Hall can deliver information to any citizen in five minutes about the building potential of any plot in the city. Updating the system is a requirement: anyone wishing to obtain or renew a business permit must provide the City Hall with information used to project traffic generation figures, infrastructure needs, parking requirements, and other impacts. The transparent information system helps to avoid land speculation and has been essential for budgetary purposes as property tax is the main source of revenue.

Incentives have also been important in reinforcing positive behavior. Within the city's historic district, owners have the right to transfer the building potential of their plots to another area of the city. This means that historical buildings are preserved and owners are compensated. Businesses throughout the city can "buy" up to two extra floors beyond the legal limit in specified areas. Payment can be in the form of cash or land, which the city then uses as resources for low-income housing.

Procedures

Time is money The longer it takes to implement solutions, the more expensive they become. Cities are not static and nor are solutions. For example, a low-cost sanitation technology that is suitable for a density of 40 families per hectare will not be suitable for a density of 100 families per hectare when the population grows, and a more costly approach might be required. Curitiba has developed alternative approaches to deal with the pollution of Iguazu river tributaries. For certain areas, however, demographic density still demands conventional approaches which represent a heavy burden on the municipality's budget. The same applies to urban design, public transport technologies, waste management techniques, low-cost drainage approaches and urban services in general.

Prevention vs. remediation With regard to environmental and urban infrastructure, for instance, it is well known that the cost of prevention may relate to the cost of remediation by a factor of 1 to 100. This applies to transport, sanitation, waste management and various other issues. In other words, it makes sense to spend one dollar today in order not to have to spend one hundred dollars tomorrow. The planning of the "structural sectors" in Curitiba is an example that demonstrates how transport costs were saved directly. Indirectly, there were savings in infrastructure improvements such as water, sewage, electricity and communication. Regrettably, most cities consider urban development interventions only when it is too late or too expensive to prevent problems. Apart from the world's mega-cities, there are also thousands of developing municipalities which do not necessarily have to make the same mistakes.

Insistence pays People are sensitive to any city administration that shows signs of constant care. Maintenance is of paramount importance in providing the population with an indication of how much the city administration is concerned. A simple example: Curitiba decided to regularly plant flowers on what had been the main avenue of the city center, and was then made the first pedestrian street in Brazil. At the time, people were not used to seeing flowers on the streets, and they were often picked up or vandalized. With time, insistence and a regular maintenance scheme, the population began to respect, and even defend, the flowers. I have personally witnessed, on various occasions, people confronting those who had picked up a single flower. The city's culture is permeable to administrative care.

Institutional streamlining How will the decision-making process work in City Hall, where there are thousands of employees and hundreds of bosses? In Curitiba, three different functions were developed separately, though with constant interfacing, namely: planning, execution and administration. Weekly meetings between the Mayor and the key actors in each one of these areas defined the targets for the week. The execution of these targets was closely monitored during the following weeks. The streamlining of institutional actors is as important as the integrated
participation of personal actors. Usually, participation can be conflictive or consensual, but it should ultimately lead to a sensible balance between planning, execution and administrative functions, in response to demands from the population.

**Incremental learning** The perfect plan will never be implemented. Rather than pursuing perfection, Curitiba concretely did what was possible to do at specific moments in time – and incrementally developed such ideas in practice when they were already operational. The land use legislation, the industrial city, bicycle paths, the parks policy, the bus design and the design of integrated public transport terminals are examples of this approach. It should be always clear that an “idea” has three components: the idea itself, its feasibility and its operation. This sequence forms a circle, which then leads to further improvements. Curitiba’s initial Master Plan is the first basic example: a book prepared in 1965 with many good potential ideas, which were later changed or improved by the first administration of Mayor Jaime Lerner in 1971 to be viable and operational.

**Participatory field work precedes desk top design** One advantage of working for local administrations is that the issues are concrete and the problems are just outside your door. This level of clarity is not easily attainable in broader levels of administration, such as States or countries. There is always a bureaucratic way of dealing with any issue and this is certainly the best way not to solve it. Planning officials, architects and other professionals in Curitiba have always been encouraged to look at the problems, talk to the people, discuss the main issues, and only then reach for the pen. This behavior has been exercised by Mayor Lerner and other mayors in Curitiba. As far as politics are concerned, people normally know when a politician is on their street just to collect votes or to collect concrete suggestions. A genuine concern in looking at the problems and talking to the people, at any level of decision-making, provides a new insight which is seldom self-evident at the drawing table.

**Possible lessons for an urbanizing world**

Some of the lessons from the Curitiba experience which other cities could use include:

1. **Top priority should be given to public transportation rather than to private cars, and to pedestrians rather than to motorized vehicles.** Bicycle paths and pedestrian areas should be an integrated part of the road network and public transportation system. In Curitiba, less attention to meeting the needs of private motorized traffic has generated less use of cars.

2. **There can be an integrated and environmentally-sensitive action plan for each set of problems, but solutions within any city are not specific and isolated, but interconnected.**

3. **The action plan should involve partnerships between responsible actors such as private sector entrepreneurs, NGOs, municipal agencies, utilities, neighborhood associations, community groups, and individuals.**

4. **Creativity can substitute for financial resources. Ideally, cities should turn what are traditional sources of problems into resources.** For example, public transport, urban solid waste, and unemployment are traditionally listed as problems, but they have the potential to become generators of new resources and solutions.

5. **Creative and labor-intensive ideas can, to some extent, substitute for capital-intensive technologies. Cities do not need to wait for bailouts or structural reforms to begin working on some of their problems.**

Other lessons include:

1. Even during a period of rapid demographic growth, physical expansion can be guided through integrated road planning, investment in public transportation and the enforcement of appropriate land use legislation.

2. **Technological solutions and standards for everything from public transit to recycling should be chosen on the basis of affordability.**

3. **Integrated solutions can be implemented through partnerships between key actors. This often requires that the network of formal and informal economic relations be supported - and not hindered - by urban managers.**

4. Public information and awareness are essential. The better citizens know their city, the better they treat it.

These principles may seem like simple doses of common sense, but they have rarely been applied to ailing cities around the world. Perhaps the missing ingredient is political commitment and continuity: Curitiba’s leaders have pursued their common-sensical path for over two decades. Beyond the city, the Curitiba case suggests that State and national governments would do well to acknowledge the strategic importance of cities as potential instruments for positive development and change.
These lessons are being learned by other cities, inside and outside of Brazil. In Brazil and other Latin American cities, pedestrian walkways, bus lanes and waste management programs that were pioneered in Curitiba have become popular urban fixtures and procedures. Cities in regions as different as Africa, Asia, North America and Europe have expressed interest in the approaches put to practice in Curitiba. Naturally, one size does not fit all, solutions need to be tailor-made, adapting to local circumstances. Not all cities enjoy Curitiba’s political will and continuity. However, at least one of Curitiba’s many creative, resource-conserving solutions may fit many cities that make up an increasingly urban world.

The challenge of replicability

Cities are not ideal subjects for scientific analysis. Urban development is the more scientific of arts, or the most artistic of sciences. The traditional scientific method, in very generic terms, is based on the principle that certain physical phenomena can be repeated in the same way if basic conditions are in place. Therefore, based on the expected results, scientific laws are established. Science, based exclusively on “experience”, can not accommodate the diversity and chaotic behavior existing within each city. Replicability laws cannot be established for urban development: common sense and hard work remain as basic rules.

After having presented the case of Curitiba on various occasions, the most frequent questions are: why are there not more “Curitibas”? What made Curitiba successful? How to transfer the positive lessons to other cities? The truth is that the experience of Curitiba only became well known some twenty years after its beginning. It has been a consistent, progressive and incremental process. Mistakes were made and later corrected. Curitiba still has serious sanitation, education, and housing problems to tackle. The challenge now is to continue the successful policies and programs, while applying these lessons to unresolved issues of urban development.

With regard to its replicability, two types of experience will be briefly described: contacts between Curitiba and other cities in Brazil or other countries, and the more recent extension of the experience of Curitiba to other cities in the State of Parana. As far as contacts with other cities are concerned, Curitiba has attracted considerable attention and became a destiny for various technical teams coming from other parts of Brazil and abroad. Among other tasks, I have been personally responsible for meeting professionals, mayors and council persons from other municipalities and for discussing with them the problems faced and lessons learned by Curitiba. On average, there have been two to three visits a week. A few observations have emerged from this process:

1. While some visitors refer to Curitiba as a “model”, others refer to the city as an “exception”. I would argue that it is neither. No city is so exceptional that some basic working principles cannot be analyzed and transferred to other cities; nevertheless, cities are intrinsically different, and it would be a mistake to choose a “cookie cutter” approach, no matter how successful a specific experience has been.

2. The different opinions expressed above probably depend on the extent to which the situation in other cities is similar or not to that of Curitiba. It has been possible to infer that, while some cities apprehended lessons due to the similarity of their situation and problems with Curitiba’s, some other cities seem to have grasped inspiration by contrast: “our city is different, and now that we have seen this solution working in Curitiba, we know we have to somehow adapt its elements to our own context.”

3. Representatives from many other cities visiting Curitiba ask about a possible “implementation formula” as to what made the solutions in Curitiba work. I would outline ten basic elements, namely: political will; leadership; continuity; community involvement; courage to develop incremental solutions (including “trial and error”); informality and commitment of the technical team; search for simple, appropriate and affordable solutions; team spirit; hard work; and good timing. These elements do not represent in themselves a formula, nor a prerequisite. However, they have been present in varying degrees throughout the various municipal administrations during the past thirty years.

Other cities would also regularly ask for a flowchart, some kind of scheme showing boxes, circles and arrows, indicating how the various institutional and social actors related to the other during the planning, implementation and evaluation of projects. It may be relatively easy to represent reality through diagrams, but these are of very limited value in reflecting the comprehensive and informal intricacies of urban governance and in transferring experience. It would be pretentious and wrong to represent complex processes such as urban development through caricatures. Perhaps due to these reasons, no flowchart was developed to explain the entire experience of Curitiba.

Many questions are usually asked about successful transfers, “twinning”, technical cooperation agreements, or simply the extent to
which the experience of Curitiba has been “exported” to other places. Brazilian cities such as Rio de Janeiro, Sao Paulo, Vitoria, Joao Pessoa, Santos, Niteroi, Florianopolis, Rio Branco, Belo Horizonte and Porto Alegre have expressed varying degrees of interest in Curitiba, as well as foreign cities such as New York, Cape Town, Montreal, Toronto, Quito, Himeji, Lagos, Caracas, Santiago, Dakar, Shanghai, among many others. The city of Curitiba does not claim the merit of having changed urban planning practices in other cities. Nevertheless, it is fair to say that, at least in the Latin American context, certain initiatives were pioneered by Curitiba and possibly inspired other practices. A few examples: the transformation of the main downtown avenue in a pedestrian mall; priority for public transport; implementation of segregated bus lanes; development of household-based waste management schemes; development of “garbage exchange” for bus tokens, food and school notebooks; incremental land use development in association with a hierarchy for the road network.

Curitiba is the capital of the State of Parana, which has a total of 339 municipalities, a population of 8.5 million and an approximate budget of around US$ 3.5 billion. In January 1994, former Mayor Jaime Lerner was elected State Governor, being today in a position to extend the experience of three successful terms of office in Curitiba to the whole State of Parana. The following are some of the main initiatives being undertaken to promote rural-urban linkages.

**Rural Villages**

The “Rural Villages Program” is an initiative of the state of Parana aimed at curbing rural migration by providing housing, infrastructure, services and jobs to rural and peri-urban dwellers. It has been partially inspired by a previous “rurban community” project implemented in Curitiba, now extended to the entire State. The rural villages are formed by small properties of 5,000 m², where the rural worker lives and develops agriculture to support his family and sells the surplus. Each rural village has less than 200 properties, which are purchased by dwellers through an affordable 25-year mortgage program. The area is provided by the participating municipalities. Families have 30 months to begin paying for the land through monthly installments that do not exceed 20 per cent of their small incomes.

The rural villages are always implemented near secondary roads, making the access to schools, health centers and basic shopping/trade easier. Municipalities do not have to invest too much in infrastructure to serve these communities. The module house has 45 m² and is built through a self-help scheme by their future owners. Potential dwellers have to apply to the State and are selected by the following criteria: the head of household should not be older than 55 years; the head of household should have lived in the municipality for at least four years; families who already own property cannot apply; the family should have an income between one and three minimum monthly wages (one monthly minimum wage in Brazil is equivalent to about US$ 100); and families should preferably have underage children, while the head of household should exercise a temporary job in rural or peri-urban areas of the municipality.

The Rural Villages Program is supported by a partnership between various governmental institutions. While the municipalities involved provide the land, the State Secretariat for Agriculture and Food approves plans for new communities according to land exploitation potential as well as technical assistance and training for a period of 30 months. The State Secretariat for Housing Policy approves plans for new communities in cooperation with the above, provides financial resources through direct loans to dwellers and provides guidance and technical assistance for housing construction. The State Secretariat for Children and Family Affairs supports newly established families through social family monitoring, as well as being in charge of the promotion of technical and income-generation training courses after the completion of houses and communities. The State Secretariat for Planning is responsible for the overall planning and coordination, while the State Secretariat for the Environment is in charge of enacting and enforcing environmental legislation and collecting and mapping land and natural resource information. Finally, the State Secretariat for Employment and Job Relations is responsible for the follow-up of working relationships and job generation aspects during implementation, the State Company for Electricity for the electricity infrastructure, and the State Company for Water and Sanitation for the water and sanitation infrastructure.

The State of Parana aims to assist 60,000 families through this project. As of August 1996 some seventy rural villages were operational or being implemented throughout the entire state. While it is rather soon to undertake a comprehensive evaluation of the program, it can be said that it definitely represents in principle a creative and participatory alternative to conventional agrarian reform practices.

**The Rural Roads Program**

Rural roads are fundamental to promote rural-rural and rural-urban integration in the countryside of the State of Parana. They have a role in
promoting transport, commerce and access to schools and health centers, enhancing economic and social contacts which are essential to promote sustainable development in rural areas. The improvement of transport and communications can help avoid rural migration, as dwellers have more direct and frequent access to urban and peri-urban centers, to agriculture storage and exchange facilities, without having to abandon their rural roots.

The Parana State’s road network is comprised of federal, State and municipal roads. Federal roads total some 3,300 kilometers; State roads comprise some 12,400 kilometers and municipal roads some 245,000 kilometers. Municipal roads are precisely those which ultimately reach the sources of agricultural production; however, only one per cent of all municipal roads are properly paved. The objective of the Rural Roads Program is to facilitate permanent basic traffic conditions in rural roads between agricultural production areas and storage and commercialization facilities and towns, thus benefiting small-scale producers and supporting access of low-income rural populations to basic health and education services.

Given the immense extension of the existing rural roads network vis-à-vis available financial resources, technical characteristics were kept as simple as possible. This means throwing away standard road construction manuals and avoiding higher costs normally charged by conventional contractors. The basic objective is to execute a 6,40 meter wide flat platform, with a single central paved lane of 3,60 ms. Paving materials vary according to local availability, the technology is labor-based and not capital-intensive. Low-cost drainage facilities are kept to a minimum.

Five pilot rural roads are being developed following this approach and the results so far seem satisfactory. Each road required a different technical solution, depending on their geophysical situation/topography, availability of construction materials and maintenance needs. Different companies have been involved with each project, following competitive bidding. The average cost per kilometer has been approximately US$ 40,000. The total target is the development of approximately 1,000 kilometers of rural roads.

The “Teachers’ University”

A “new town” has been developed close to the city of Faxinal do Ceu in the countryside of Parana, to support seven-day advanced education workshops aimed at the 80,000 public teachers of the State - comprising elementary, high school and university levels. Accommodation, restaurant, meeting rooms, leisure facilities and all necessary infrastructure have been built to support these “educational jamborees” designed to get teachers to share their experiences through special retreats. During these intensive workshops, teachers participate in daily journeys that can begin at 7:00 a.m. and end at 11:00 p.m. Sessions on subjects are as varied as Eastern Thinking, Opera, Fitness, Dancing, Painting, Philosophy and Psychology. The courses expand the knowledge of those who are forming the future generations.

Every week, 144 working groups follow the seven-day workshop. Each working group cannot exceed seven participants. All working groups also follow a three-phase program from Monday to Thursday. In the first phase, they establish the group’s internal management rules and undertake their own assessment of the main problems faced by teachers in their respective areas of work; the second phase focuses on possible solutions for the their problems, and the third phase is dedicated to the development of a report emphasizing successful concrete teaching experiences. Out of 144 reports, 24 are chosen every week to be presented to all groups in the last day of the seminar. By the end of 1996, there were some 1,000 reports in a database to be circulated around the entire State.

The “Teachers’ University” counts on 12 full-time resident staff members and a total of 24 inter-disciplinary professionals forming the management team. The seminars are also supported by 48 supervisors, who help link participants with coordination staff. Some of the most experienced professionals in the State are invited as guest lecturers to speak about issues as diverse as nature conservation, poetry and politics in Ancient Rome.

Program for the Indigenous peoples of Parana

The State of Parana was originally occupied by various Indian groups, of which the Kaingang and Guarani survive. The Xeta tribe, for instance, has been approached by “civilization” in the 1950s and are practically extinct; only six individuals remain. The Indigenous communities currently grow at four per cent a year, a relatively high growth rate if compared to the average 1.5 per cent observed in the South of Brazil. However, due to lack of choice and opportunities, their reduced members are constantly migrating to cities, where they increase homelessness and joblessness statistics. Although their culture and traditions have contributed to preserve some of the most extensive pinewood forests in the State, their land is constantly threatened by the “white men”, mostly loggers, farmers and land speculators.
The aim of the abovementioned program is to preserve their culture, language, traditions and land, while at the same time trying to revert the problem of poverty (and hunger) which affects most Indigenous communities in Parana. The first phase focuses on the Mangueirinha reserve, having two basic priorities: support the social, cultural, economic, environmental sustainability of the Indian community; and preserve the largest *araucaria angustifolia* (a native pine tree) forest worldwide. The Mangueirinha reserve has a total area of 17 million hectares and a population of 1,617 Indians. The State Secretariat for the Environment is undertaking the following initiatives: provision of latrines, septic tanks and other basic sanitation facilities; alleviation of the impact caused by roads crossing the area through signing, “traffic calming” road works and incentives to tourism; the existence of the Indian reservation is being clearly marked by gateways and specific points for the sale of handicrafts are being created; and special education programs are being developed for the 300 Indian children attending school. Moreover, new houses are being built taking into consideration the lifestyle of Indian communities and locally available building materials; specific monitoring points and control towers are being created to enforce the legal exploitation of natural resources in the area; and social monitoring and support to Indian communities is being provided.

Apart from the above, an environmental education initiative is being developed, based on a successful program for children in low-income neighborhoods already implemented in Curitiba. This initiative aims to preserve Indian traditions and to provide job training. Indians are receiving training on how to raise cattle; technical assistance, basic equipment and seeds for the development of fruit crops; construction of small dams for pisciculture; construction of a brick factory using locally available clay as raw material; training for sustainable forestry practices; training for the operation and maintenance of basic agriculture machinery; and training for the extraction and sale of *pinhão* (edible pine tree seeds). In each village, the government offers a food subsidy during six months for each family during the first year of the program.

**Replicability lessons from the State of Parana**

The experience of Curitiba has developed into a useful reference for other cities in Brazil and worldwide. However, urban-related problems do not exist in isolation from the surrounding countryside, and the extension of Curitiba’s lessons to other cities in the State of Parana already provides some elements for the analysis of rural-urban linkages and the replicability of urban governance experiences.

As was mentioned above, following three alternate terms as mayor of Curitiba, Jaime Lerner was elected Governor of the State of Parana in January 1994. As Governor, former Mayor of the capital, recipient of various international awards and holder of high approval ratings among voters and strong credibility, Governor Lerner is today in a position to influence municipal policies across the State and to propose a series of concrete interventions inspired by the experience of Curitiba.

The distribution of human and financial resources from the State government to municipalities is not being subject to political criteria; for example, according to all the information received, all mayors receive equal support regardless of their political parties. Technical assistance is not developed in a patronizing manner. Mayors of recipient municipalities have to contribute resources as well as the people who benefit from the programs.

The activities being developed clearly indicate the policy priorities chosen to promote rural-urban linkages. Job generation for the provision of basic needs, housing/services, transport and education are the pervasive themes existing in the main programs briefly described above. The approaches being developed so far also indicate that potentially successful sub-regional programs do not depend on the availability of massive financial resources. Proper technology choices, participatory approaches, informal solutions and clear institutional roles can help promote affordable initiatives.

Promoting rural development without causing further rural migration is challenging. The poor are not satisfied to remain poor: quite often, as soon a family’s income increase and they accumulate savings, migration of the head of the household to the nearest town or city may follow. Many rural development programs have failed as they ended up by increasing rural migration. The approaches being adopted in Parana may avoid this tendency due to the following characteristics:

1. Participatory programs are instilling a long-term sense of responsibility, thus becoming sustainable. In the rural villages, for example, instead of receiving a subsidized home, families receive basic assistance and a loan to buy the land and build their own home. Families have to pay for the land, on which they choose to develop an activity that they are familiar with. Rural migrants normally have to abandon their knowledge of agriculture to survive in a city. By facilitating access to their own land, the program motivates families to continue the activities they were already developing on other people’s land, without creating any significant disruption in family life.
Complementary education programs contribute to avoid rural migration. No family voluntarily migrates if they see their children having access to public school, receiving free meals and standard education. Once motivated, teachers improve the quality of education and children attend school more often. The existence of training courses for adults also prevent the frequent lure for better education opportunities that normally exist in cities.

The attention being given to transport, beginning with rural roads, is an important element. By having access to storage facilities and commerce/trade points, rural producers are motivated to remain on their land, while enjoying access to commercial channels normally associated with urban areas. Schools and health facilities also become more accessible.

The technical team now in charge of the State of Parana is similar to the technical team that was in charge of Curitiba. Many former Municipal Secretaries were appointed State Secretaries by Governor Lerner. On the one hand, it is a competent, experienced and motivated team. On the other hand, this team is facing the added challenge of having to execute projects through existing municipalities. The playing field is not even: the technical capacity of municipalities in Brazil can vary tremendously from one area to another. It is still too soon to determine to what extent Governor Lerner and his team are carrying out their work with other municipalities in a homogeneous manner. Nevertheless, the creative approaches being adopted and the initial results are inspirational and encouraging.

Conclusion

The main conclusion from the abovementioned experience is that to think urban is indeed to think hope, and not despair. Cities may not be intrinsically sustainable, but they can definitely be made more sustainable and contribute to people-centered sustainability. The urban environment permits the efficient mobilization of people's energies and human potential, as it enhances the income-generating ability of the informal sector and promotes education and skills training. Cities spearhead economic development, and they transform society through growth in the productivity of labor. The economies of scale found in cities make them capable of generating goods and services in excess if their share of the national population.

The current international scenario seems to favor enhanced relationships between the international community, national governments and local authorities. The potential of cities to support a path towards sustainability gradually becomes acknowledged by national governments. At the same time, considerable work needs to be undertaken before the cities and peri-urban areas actually change positively for all their inhabitants. Approaches that regard urban areas as a continuity of peri-urban and rural areas need to be included in the policy agenda.

Cities produce a large part of the Gross Domestic Product, indicating a high per capita productivity. Markets for labor, capital and technology transform advantages of location into higher incomes and employment opportunities. Urbanization restructures social relations and improves life expectations; child-bearing women usually insist on smaller families and are introduced to family planning notions when moving to urban and peri-urban areas.

Greater participation in the urban economy leads to the creation of a skilled and literate work force. In short, the full use of the human development potential in urban areas is directly related to the promotion of policies conducive to improvements in the urban environment and urban economics.

Notes

7. The International Union of Local Authorities-UILA, the United Towns Organization-UTO, Metropolis and the Summit of the World's Major Cities formed the "Group of Four" at the time of the International Colloquium of Mayors for Social Development, held at the United Nations in August 1994. Other global and regional cities' associations later joined, forming the so-called "Group of Four Plus", which participated under this name at the Second United Nations Conference on Human Settlements (Habitat II).
8. "Isto É", Brazilian magazine, No. 1,404, August 1996, Sao Paulo, Brazil.
3 The role of NGOs and CBOs in a sustainable development strategy for Metropolitan Cape Town, South Africa

Vuyiswa Tindleni

Introduction

The Cape Town Metropolitan Area (CMA) is surrounded by natural barriers, the Atlantic Ocean to the West and South, False Bay to the South-east and Hottentots Holland evolution to the North and East. It is a sprawling city which is home to a population of about 3.6 million people. The CMA is expanding rapidly and has large and growing peripheral urban settlements. Cape Town has a Mediterranean climate, and at 34 degrees it is far enough south to jut into the West wind drift in the winter. Cape Town is exposed to cold wet weather from the North and West in winter and strong Southerly and Easterly winds in summer.

South Africa is prominent in its diverse culture, language and environment. In climate, natural environment and majority politics Cape Town is different, but with respect to diversities of people and sharp disparities between rich and poor in access to services it is similar to much of the rest of the country. Cape Town is not a peaceful city: it has a high rate of petty and violent crime, and it's at present experiencing a show-down between organized crime and vigilante groups. The Cape Town City Council, recently renamed the Central Substructure, is the largest of six sub-structures which constitute the CMA. It is in the process of revising policies and strategies to address past disadvantages and discrepancies which characterized the past.

The Coalition for Sustainable Cities (CSC) is making an effort to work in partnership with the Cape Metropolitan Council and the Central

References


